

Dynamics of Transitional Land Conflicts and Challenges of Land Policy Implementation: Case Study of Urban-Rural Transition Areas

Yuyun Kadarlia, S.H., M.Kn.

Doctoral Study, Universitas Islam As-Syafi'iyah, Indonesia

yuyunkadarlia@gmail.com

Abstract

This research investigates the dynamics of transitional land conflicts and the challenges of implementing land policies, focusing on a case study of urban-rural transition areas. Transitional land conflicts are complex phenomena arising from the interaction between rapid urban development and adjacent rural areas. The main objective of this research is to understand the root causes of transitional land conflicts and identify the main challenges in implementing land policies in this context. The research methodology involves a qualitative approach, including in-depth interviews with relevant stakeholders, field observations, and document analysis. The findings indicate that transitional land conflicts are triggered by various factors, including differences in interests among landowners, developers, government authorities, and local communities. Legal uncertainty, weak enforcement of regulations, and lack of community participation in decision-making are also major complicating factors in the implementation of land policies. Furthermore, this research identifies several specific challenges in managing transitional land conflicts, including the complexity of land ownership, rapid land use changes, and power imbalances among various stakeholders. The implications of these findings underscore the need for a holistic and integrated approach in formulating land policies that can accommodate the needs and interests of all stakeholders. Thus, this research provides important contributions to understanding the dynamics of transitional land conflicts and the challenges of implementing land policies in urban-rural transition areas. Recommendations are made to strengthen regulatory frameworks, enhance community participation in decision-making processes, and develop effective dispute resolution mechanisms to address the challenges encountered in managing transitional land conflicts.

Keywords: *Rural to Urban, Land Conflict, Land Policy*

I. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia was among the top ten fastest urbanizing countries in the world from 1990-2014 and has the second most dense urban population in East Asia after China. Indonesia has around 137 million urban residents which is 53.7 percent of the total population. Indonesia's urban population increased by an average of 4.1 percent per year between 2000 and 2010, faster than in any other country in Asia. By 2025, it is estimated that 68 percent of Indonesians will live in cities. But Indonesia has not yet benefited fully from the positive returns to urbanization that other countries in the region have experienced. From 1970 to 2006, every one percent increase in urban population correlated with an average increase of 6-10 percent in several middle-income countries in Asia such as China, Thailand, Vietnam and India.

The transformation phenomenon that occurs in urban areas is actually not something new, but is a gradual process. Today the world is in a postmodern era which has an impact on almost all aspects of life. In metropolitan areas, this has an impact on changing the urban face by spatial processes and resulting in comprehensive changes to the urban structure.¹

The urban-rural area, as a border entity between urban and rural areas, witnesses dynamic changes in the structure of land and society. This transformation, often accompanied by a shift from traditional agriculture to urban development, creates an environment prone to transitional land conflicts. In recent decades, Indonesia has witnessed rapid urban growth, and with it, dramatic changes in land use patterns, inviting deep questions about how these changes affect social and economic stability in urban-rural areas.

This context becomes the main stage for increasingly complex transitional land conflicts. The shift from traditional agriculture to non-agricultural activities, such as housing and industry, creates pressure on available land resources. At the same time, local communities and agricultural actors who have lived in this area for a long time are experiencing significant impacts on their livelihoods. Transitional land conflicts are not just physical disputes over land, but also include struggles over the values, rights and identity of local communities.

Urban growth and agricultural transformation cannot be separated from the role of land policy. Land policies that are appropriate to the dynamics of these changes are

¹ Helbich, M. (2012). Beyond Post-suburbia? Multifunctional Service Agglomeration in Vienna's Urban Fringe: Multifunctional Service Agglomeration In Vienna's Urban Fringe. *Tijdschrift Voor Economische En Sociale Geografie*, 103(1), 39–52.

the key to reducing tensions, facilitating conflict resolution, and maintaining sustainable land use. However, the biggest challenge arises in implementing these policies on the ground, where various interests and perceptions collide.

According to Abdurrahman, he has introduced that to solve problems, an integrated approach is needed. In solving various problems relating to land, you must not only pay attention to legal (juridical) principles, but you must also pay attention to the principles of prosperity (prosperity), the principles of security and order and the principles of humanity so that land problems do not develop. become unrest that disrupts the stability of society.²

In this context, this research seeks to investigate the dynamics of transitional land conflicts in urban-rural areas with a focus on the challenges of land policy implementation. Case studies conducted in specific areas will provide a clearer picture of the complexity of the situation, detailing the impact of the conflict at the local community and economic level. Thus, this research seeks to make a real contribution to the understanding of transitional land conflicts and develop policy recommendations that can overcome practical obstacles in the field.

By investigating in depth the context of transitional land conflicts, we want to develop a better understanding of how these changes affect the sustainability of urban-rural areas. It is hoped that the conclusions resulting from this research will help policy makers, researchers and practitioners in developing more effective strategies in responding to the challenges of transitional land conflicts in the future.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Dynamics of Transitional Land Conflicts in Urban-Rural Contexts: In the in-depth literature on transitional land conflicts, it is important to understand the dynamics of land change and urban growth in areas bordering urban and rural areas. Conflicts often arise when agricultural traditions collide with the demands of urban development. Village provides a very broad meaning, meaning and definition, because village exists in various scientific disciplines, realities of life and power structures. The village, as a natural environment, often provides a romantic association for city residents (who are busy, inhumane and far from nature) to find tranquility, clean natural air and full of human values.³ The interaction between urban growth and changes in agricultural policy has led to

² Abdurrahman, Various Agrarian Law Problems in Development in Indonesia (Bandung: Alumni, 1978), p.38 ³ Hagul, peter. 1992. Village Development and Non-Governmental Organizations. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.

complex land conflicts in various regions in Indonesia. Especially in the Karawang Regency area, economic and industrial growth is in line with increasingly limited land availability.

This has implications for high land prices and reduced agricultural land. Conventional agriculture has a direct impact on the region's ability to provide adequate food needs, resulting in the fulfillment of food needs that must be provided or sent from outside the region. This causes additional costs and higher purchasing prices for food and overall leads to a higher cost of living for people.

The local government has not responded optimally to regional readiness in dealing with this matter. How to help conventional agriculture transition to modern agriculture so that it can be in line with regional developments. The local government, in this case the Village scope, can control the transition of land function and its use. Villages are an important part of the Indonesian State, the position of villages is given specifically with the principles of recognition and subsidiarity regulated in Article 3 of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages (hereinafter referred to as the Village Law). By implementing these principles, villages have the authority to regulate themselves based on their assets and all the potential they have. Village authority based on rights of origin (recognition) is the village's right to organize its government based on the initiative of the village community in accordance with the original culture of the village community which does not conflict with the law.

Village authority is explained in article 19 of the Village Law, including³: (1) authority based on ordinary rights; (2) Village scale local authority; (3) authority assigned by the Government, Provincial Regional Government, or Regency/City Regional Government; and (4) other authorities assigned by the Government, Provincial Regional Government, or Regency/City Regional Government in accordance with the provisions of statutory regulations.

Villages can then prepare development plans that are in line with Regency/City development plans. Village development planning is carried out by involving village communities through participatory village development planning deliberations. Rural area spatial planning is carried out to empower rural areas, maintain environmental quality, preserve local cultural heritage, conserve natural resources, maintain agropolitan areas and other goals.

³ Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages.

A broad understanding and perspective is needed for policy makers in preparing village development plans, so that the interests of society in general can be accepted and benefited equally, fairly and prosperously. Policymakers are required to be able to bridge all interests and find the most appropriate and just solutions.

B. Land Policy Paradigm Shift: The importance of understanding the paradigm shift in land policy. Traditionally, land policy has tended to favor traditional agriculture. However, in an era of rapid urban growth, land policy must evolve to cover emerging new aspects, such as land conversion and property rights. In implementation in the field, conflicts still continue to occur and cannot provide a sense of justice for all parties.

The problem of spatial planning in Indonesia is currently very complex and must be given more attention. Law Number 26 of 2007⁴ concerning Spatial Planning currently does not accommodate the needs of society as a whole, especially local communities, in this case villages. In Article 5 paragraph (3) of Law Number 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning, it is stated that: "Spatial planning based on administrative regions consists of national regional spatial planning, provincial spatial planning, and district/city regional spatial planning."

Current spatial planning arrangements tend to be top down and the regulation stops only at the district/city level. Apart from that, according to the spatial planning law, the implementation of spatial planning in Indonesia has currently only reached the planning stage and its implementation has not been able to meet the needs of local communities. Regional spatial planning products that have become regulations also give rise to various problems, such as regional spatial planning not being able to fully function as a basis for development programs and guidance for the community in utilizing space and the community not being aware of the importance of spatial planning, especially those related to land conversion. productive for other purposes.⁵

With rapid economic growth and the potential to reduce the availability of agricultural land, comprehensive regional mapping is needed accompanied by preparation for appropriate technology transfer in order to balance the needs of land transition actors in urban-rural areas, providing the most appropriate solutions and economic equality in the future.

⁴ Law Number 27 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning.

⁵ Sutaryono, Village-Based Spatial Planning (Strategy for Reducing Conflicts in the Use of Space), (Yogyakarta: National Defense College), p. 2.

C. Social and Economic Implications of Transitional Land Conflicts: The social and economic implications of transitional land conflicts have a significant impact on society and the economy at various levels. These conflicts not only affect landowners and parties directly involved, but can also have far-reaching consequences for social stability and economic growth in a region.

In this context, transitional land conflict is tension that arises due to changes in land status from rural to urban or vice versa.

The social and economic implications of such conflicts are complex and varied.

Social Implications:

Transitional land conflicts often give rise to tensions and conflicts between residents, especially in areas inhabited by indigenous communities or small farmers. This can threaten social stability and cause divisions within communities. Uncertainty and anxiety are also serious problems in this context. Societies involved in conflict tend to experience high levels of uncertainty regarding their future, security and well-being. Land conflicts often result in damage to social relations and can undermine solidarity among residents, threatening the harmony and sustainability of communities.

The social implications of transitional land conflicts cannot be ignored either. In the context of rural communities, land conflicts often create tension between individuals and communities, disrupt existing social relationships, and can even cause internal conflict among community members.

Economic Implications:

The economic impact of transitional land conflicts is also significant. This conflict can hamper investment and local economic development because it creates legal and security uncertainty for local investors and entrepreneurs. Disruption to production activities, especially in the agricultural and small industry sectors, is also a major problem. This impacts the income and livelihoods of local communities, causing a decline in production and income. In addition, transitional land conflicts can also cause economic losses for individuals, families and communities as a whole. These economic losses can take the form of property damage, loss of a source of income, or high legal costs.

When land conflicts are not handled well, the social and economic implications can affect the welfare and stability of a region as a whole. Therefore, resolving land conflicts must carefully consider these two aspects, involve active participation from all stakeholders, and seek fair and sustainable solutions.

Therefore, handling transitional land conflicts needs to pay attention to the diversity of local contexts and strengthen participation and protection of affected communities.

This shows that transitional land conflicts not only have a physical impact on the land map, but also create social and economic inequality. It is hoped that this research will provide insight into the ways land conflicts can change community structures and affect traditional livelihoods.

D. The Role of Policy in Resolving Land Conflicts: Land law policy covers fundamental aspects, namely the principle of fulfilling people's constitutional rights in order to meet their daily living needs and respecting the principle of human equality.

The state foundation of Pancasila, the Constitution of UUD 45 and the legal basis in the form of the UUPA demand that political direction and policy as well as land management be able to make a real contribution to the process of realizing social justice and maximum prosperity for all the Indonesian people.

One of the objectives of the formation of the Republic of Indonesia as mandated by the 1945 NRI Constitution is to realize general welfare within the framework of clean and good governance. The word governance refers to the understanding that power is no longer solely owned or the business of the government, the people, stakeholders and social institutions outside the government must be able to participate in encouraging the government to achieve its vision and mission of improving the welfare of its people. The important role of land policy that is inclusive and responsive to the dynamics of change in urban-rural areas.

One of them is Law Number 19 of 2013⁶ concerning the Protection and Empowerment of Farmers, which is a form of public policy whose function is to regulate some of the activities of the nation, state, government and society. where law number 19 of 2013 specifically regulates the desired Farmer Protection and Empowerment activities, one of the aims of which is to create prosperity for farmers. "Policy is a statement of will regarding alternative choices that are desired to be carried out and which are built on the basis of will regulation, in its actualization it is formulated in the form of statutory regulations".⁷

E. Obstacles to Land Policy Implementation: The implementation of land policy in transitional land conflict areas is often faced with a number of obstacles that can hamper the process. We summarize several main factors that are common obstacles

⁶ Law Number 19 of 2013 concerning Protection and Empowerment of Farmers.

⁷ Ali, Faried and Syamsu Alam, 2012, Government policy study, PT. Refika Aditama, Bandung.

in the implementation of land policy in transitional land conflict areas in several aspects, including:

Inequitable Access to Information: One of the main obstacles is unequal access to information among stakeholders involved in land conflicts. Some parties may have greater access to information and resources, while others may not have the same access. This can complicate fair dialogue and negotiation processes.

Resistance from Related Parties: Parties involved in transitional land conflicts often have different and often conflicting interests.

Resistance from these parties to proposed policies or solutions can become a serious obstacle in the implementation of land policy.

Lack of Coordination Between Government Agencies: Lack of coordination and collaboration between various government agencies involved in resolving transitional land conflicts can hamper policy implementation efforts. Without effective coordination, proposed policies may not work well or be inconsistent with other policies and programs.

Lack of Institutional Capacity: Institutions involved in resolving transitional land conflicts may experience a lack of capacity in terms of human, technological and financial resources. This lack of capacity can limit an institution's ability to formulate and implement policies effectively.

Legal Uncertainty: Legal uncertainty regarding land ownership and land rights can also be an obstacle in resolving transitional land conflicts. Unregistered land or conflicting claims can create uncertainty and confusion among stakeholders.

To overcome these obstacles, comprehensive and coordinated efforts are needed between government, society and other stakeholders. This includes increasing access to information, open and inclusive dialogue, improving coordination between government agencies, increasing institutional capacity, and legal reform that clarifies land ownership status and related rights.

- F. Local Community Views on Transitional Land Conflicts:** Local communities' views on transitional land conflicts can vary depending on the cultural, social, economic and political context in which the conflict occurs. Afrizal said that the phenomenon of agrarian conflict in Indonesia is a phenomenon full of oppression and violence.⁸ This is what makes local agrarian protest activists carry out gradual

⁸ Afrizal. 2006. *Sociology of Agrarian Conflict: Agrarian Protests in Contemporary Society*. Andalas: University Press.

actions to fight for their interests and those of their communities. However, in general, several viewing patterns that may emerge are as follows:

Uncertainty and Concern: Local communities often feel uncertain about their future as transitional land conflicts often involve unclear laws and land ownership. This uncertainty can create anxiety and tension among local communities.

Loss of Rights and Justice: Transitional land conflicts often result in the displacement or eviction of local communities from their land. This can be felt as a loss of rights and injustice by local communities, especially if they have lived on and managed the land for a long time for generations.

Feeling Marginalized and Unheard: Local communities may feel marginalized and unheard by those in charge of resolving the conflict. When decisions about land are taken without their consultation or participation, this can increase distrust and tension among local communities.

Struggle for Cultural and Traditional Identity: Land often has deep meaning in the culture and identity of local communities. Transitional land conflicts could threaten their cultural and traditional heritage, as well as fuel struggles to defend traditional rights to land and natural resources.

Community Solidarity and Activism: On the other hand, transitional land conflicts can also trigger solidarity among local communities and generate activism movements to fight for their rights. Local communities often try to unite and fight against the injustices they face.

The views of local communities on transitional land conflicts are very important to understand in efforts to resolve conflicts in a sustainable and fair manner. Paying attention to the views and needs of local communities can help create more inclusive and sustainable solutions for all parties involved.

By embracing a multidisciplinary perspective and detailing the contributions of previous research, this research aims to make a concrete contribution to the literature and policy practice in response to the challenges faced by communities in the affected region.

III. METHODOLOGY

The research method for studying the dynamics of transitional land conflicts and the challenges of implementing land policy in urban-rural areas is a comprehensive approach. This research uses a combined qualitative and quantitative approach to understand in depth the context and complexity of land conflicts.

A qualitative approach was used to gain in-depth insight into the views, perceptions and direct experiences of stakeholders regarding land conflicts. This can be achieved through in-depth interviews, participant observation and analysis of relevant documents. On the other hand, a quantitative approach is used to measure and analyze statistical data related to land conflicts and land policy implementation.

The case study research design allows researchers to gain an in-depth understanding of conflict dynamics in specific locations in urban-rural areas.

Data collection was carried out through various techniques, including interviews, surveys, observations, and document analysis.

The results of data collection were then analyzed using qualitative and quantitative approaches. Qualitative data analysis involves coding, thematics, and interpretation of qualitative data, while quantitative analysis involves statistical techniques for analyzing quantitative data.

Interpretation of research results is carried out by summarizing the main findings, linking these findings to relevant theories, and drawing conclusions about the implications of the research for theory and practice in resolving land conflicts and implementing land policy.

The validity and reliability of the research were maintained using techniques such as data triangulation, cross-checking, and the use of mixed methods. Thus, this research method can provide holistic and in-depth insight into the dynamics of transitional land conflicts and the challenges of implementing land policies in urban-rural areas.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The research results document various dynamics of transitional land conflict, including forms of inequality in land access, impacts on local community livelihoods, and changes in land use patterns. The analysis reveals the complexity of cooperation and conflict between stakeholders, obstacles in implementing effective land policies gathered from interviews and field observations. Meanwhile, quantitative data analysis involves statistical processing and descriptive analysis of numerical data collected through surveys and other data sources. Research participants were selected purposively based on criteria relevant to the context of transitional land conflicts in urban-rural areas. Participants include a wide range of stakeholders, including farmers, landowners, government officials, and other members of local communities. Active participation from various parties allows researchers to gain diverse and holistic insights into land conflicts and land policy implementation challenges. This research was conducted with due regard to research ethics, including privacy, confidentiality

and participants' rights. Information collected from participants is guaranteed to be kept confidential and used only for research purposes. Participants were given the opportunity to provide informed consent before engaging in the research, and they were also given the right to withdraw at any time without consequences.

Findings and Analysis: The research results show that transitional land conflicts in urban-rural areas have complex and varied dynamics, which are influenced by various social, economic, political and cultural factors. These conflicts do not only involve physical fights over land, but also include fights over the values, rights and identity of local communities. One of the main findings is that the shift from traditional agriculture to non-agricultural activities, such as housing and industry, has created enormous pressure on available land resources. This causes conflict between landowners, farmers, and other parties interested in different land uses. In addition, the implementation of land policy in urban-rural areas is faced with a number of complex challenges. These challenges include unequal access to information, resistance from related parties, lack of coordination between government agencies, lack of institutional capacity, and legal uncertainty regarding land ownership. The analysis also shows that local communities' views on transitional land conflicts vary widely, but often reflect uncertainty, concerns and struggles to maintain their traditional rights to land.

Recommendation: Based on the findings and analysis that have been presented, this research concludes that transitional land conflicts in urban-rural areas are a complex problem and require a comprehensive approach in resolving them. Implementing responsive, inclusive and sustainable land policies is key to reducing tensions and ensuring equitable and sustainable development in the region. To overcome the challenges faced in resolving transitional land conflicts, this research recommends several concrete steps, including:

1. Increase access to information and transparency in the conflict resolution process.
2. Strengthen coordination and collaboration between various relevant government agencies.
3. Increase the capacity of relevant institutions in formulating and implementing land policies.
4. Clarifying and strengthening the legal framework related to land ownership and land rights.
5. Increase the active participation of local communities in the decisionmaking process regarding transitional land conflicts. By implementing these steps, it is hoped that the resolution of transitional land conflicts in urbanrural areas can be

more effective and sustainable, which will ultimately support inclusive and sustainable development in the region.

The discussion section discusses the presentation of findings on land policy theory and practice. The challenges of policy implementation and opportunities for improvement are appreciated by the efficient role of various parties in dealing with transitional land conflicts.

1. **Dynamics of Transitional Land Conflicts:** The discussion begins with an understanding of the complexity of land conflicts in regions experiencing a transition from traditional agriculture to non-agricultural land uses such as housing and industry. The social, economic, political and cultural factors that influence the dynamics of this conflict are explained in detail.
2. **Effects of Land Use Shifts:** These shifts are argued to be the main trigger for conflict. The discussion makes clear how pressure on available land resources increased due to these changes, giving rise to competition between landowners, farmers, and other parties interested in different land uses.
3. **Policy Implementation Challenges:** The discussion touched on the challenges in implementing land policy in the region. Included in this discussion are unequal access to information, resistance from various parties, lack of coordination between government agencies, and legal uncertainty regarding land ownership.
4. **Local Community Perspective:** Understanding local community views on land conflicts is also discussed. The discussion highlighted these diverse views reflecting uncertainty, concerns and struggles to maintain traditional land rights.
5. **Conclusions and Recommendations:** The discussion leads to the conclusion that conflict resolution requires a comprehensive and inclusive approach. The recommendations provided include increasing access to information, strengthening collaboration between government agencies, increasing institutional capacity, clarifying the legal framework, and increasing local community participation in decision making.

The elaboration of this discussion will help further understanding of the findings and implications of this research, as well as provide a basis for next steps in dealing with transitional land conflicts in urban-rural areas.

V. CONCLUSION

Conclusions and suggestions regarding transitional land conflicts and their implications require a deep understanding of the complexity of this problem as well as strategic thinking to create sustainable solutions. The following is a more detailed discussion regarding conclusions and suggestions regarding transitional land conflicts:

1. **Multi-Factors and Legal Uncertainty:** Transitional land conflicts occur due to the interaction of various factors, including urbanization, population growth, unclear

land use policies, and legal uncertainty regarding land ownership. This condition creates an environment that is vulnerable to conflict.

2. **Social and Economic Impacts:** Transitional land conflicts have serious social and economic impacts on local communities. Tensions between community groups, economic losses, and obstacles to regional development are the consequences of this conflict.
3. **Environmental Vulnerability:** Land use changes resulting from conflict can cause significant environmental damage, including deforestation, habitat degradation and loss of biodiversity.

Difficulty in Resolving: Resolving transitional land conflicts is often difficult because it involves various conflicting interests and legal complexities related to land ownership and use.

Suggestion:

1. **Strengthening Laws and Regulations:** The government needs to increase the clarity of laws and regulations regarding land ownership and use. This involves developing policies that are more inclusive and favor the interests of local communities, including traditional farmers and indigenous communities.
2. **Public Education and Awareness:** The importance of increasing public understanding and awareness of their rights regarding land and the environment. Effective education and advocacy programs can help strengthen the community's position in conflict resolution.
3. **Multistakeholder Collaboration:** Sustainable solutions require active collaboration between government, civil society, the private sector and international institutions. This approach allows various parties to share knowledge, resources and authority in resolving conflicts in a fair and sustainable way.
4. **Developing Economic Alternatives:** Developing economic alternatives for conflict-affected communities can help reduce tensions and increase social stability. Initiatives such as sustainable agriculture, community-based tourism and sustainable management of natural resources can be long-term solutions.
5. **Environmental Protection:** The main priority in conflict resolution is protecting the environment and maintaining biodiversity. Environmental protection measures must be an integral part of any proposed solution.

By taking concrete steps based on a deep understanding of transitional land conflict issues, it is hoped that society can achieve a sustainable resolution and produce positive impacts for all parties involved.

REFERENCE

- Abdurrahman, Various Agrarian Law Problems in Development in Indonesia (Bandung: Alumni, 1978), p.38
- Afrizal. 2006. Sociology of Agrarian Conflict: Agrarian Protests in Contemporary Society. Andalas: University Press.
- Ali, Faried and Syamsu Alam, 2012, Government policy study, PT. Refika Aditama, Bandung.
- Hagul, Peter. 1992. Village Development and Non-Governmental Organizations. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Helbich, M. (2012). Beyond Post-suburbia? Multifunctional Service Agglomeration in Vienna's Urban Fringe: Multifunctional Service Agglomeration In Vienna's Urban Fringe. Tijdschrift Voor Economische En Sociale Geografie, 103(1), 39–52.
- Sutaryono, Village-Based Spatial Planning (Strategy for Reducing Space Utilization Conflicts), (Yogyakarta: National Defense College), p. 2.
- Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages.
- Law Number 27 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning.
- Law Number 19 of 2013 concerning Protection and Empowerment of Farmers.